

Exhibit 1

Vaughn Index
Cury v. U.S. Department of State, 23-cv-00499 (W.D. Wash.)

<u>Doc. No.</u>	<u>Doc. Type</u>	<u>Pages</u>	<u>Date / Date Range</u>	<u>Author(s) / Recipient(s)</u>	<u>Review Result</u>	<u>FOIA Exemptions Claimed</u>
(1-6)						
A-00000764850	NIV Applicant Case	18	Undated	Bureau of Consular Affairs	Denied in Full ("DIF")	(b)(3) Immigration and Nationality Act ("INA"), (b)(5) – deliberative process privilege ("DPP"), (b)(6), (b)(7)(C), ¹ and (b)(7)(E)
A-00000764851	NIV Applicant Case	16	Undated			
A-00000764852	NIV Applicant Case	17	Undated			
A-00000764853	NIV Applicant Case	16	Undated			
A-00000764854	NIV Applicant Case	18	Undated			
A-00000764855	NIV Applicant Case	25	Undated			

DESCRIPTION: These documents are printouts from the Bureau of Consular Affairs' Consular Consolidated Database ("CCD") entitled "NIV Applicant Case Lookup Detail." The documents contain information concerning the adjudication of visa applications for Julio Miguel Cury David, including consular comments, application data, and other pertinent data. The documents are marked "Sensitive But Unclassified."

The Department withheld these documents in full under FOIA Exemption 3, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3), pursuant to § 222(f) of the Immigration and Nationality Act ("INA"), 8 U.S.C. § 1202(f), because they pertain directly to the issuance or refusal of a visa to enter the United States.

The Department also withheld information in these documents describing internal deliberations regarding proposed courses of action with respect to the applicant under FOIA Exemption 5, 5 U.S.C. § 522(b)(5), pursuant to the deliberative process privilege.² This information is subject to the deliberative process privilege because it is both predecisional (it predates the final visa adjudication) and deliberative (it makes a recommendation and provides advice about the final visa adjudication). The Department has considered the foreseeable harm standard when reviewing the documents and applying this FOIA exemption. In particular, release of this information would result in foreseeable harm

¹ This Vaughn index describes all FOIA exemptions claimed by the Department except the privacy-related exemptions, FOIA Exemptions 6 and 7(C), which Plaintiffs have indicated they do not wish to challenge. However, to avoid any confusion on the issue, the Department has noted the documents for which it claimed FOIA Exemptions 6 and/or 7(C).

² The Department did not originally assert Exemption 5 in connection with these documents. Upon further review, the Department asserts this exemption over the portions of these records as described.

Cury v. U.S. Dep't of State
 No. 23-cv-00499
 Vaughn Index

<u>Doc. No.</u>	<u>Doc. Type</u>	<u>Pages</u>	<u>Date / Date Range</u>	<u>Author(s) / Recipient(s)</u>	<u>Review Result</u>	<u>FOIA Exemptions Claimed</u>
by inhibiting candid internal discussions and the expression of recommendations and judgments regarding visa applications and preferred courses of action by Department and other U.S. Government personnel concerning the adjudication of such applications.						
The Department also withheld the documents pursuant to FOIA Exemption 7(E), 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(E), as they contain information about specific law enforcement techniques used by the Department to assess an alien's eligibility for a visa. The CCD is a non-public database used to administer and enforce U.S. immigration laws and to identify and prevent instances of fraud. Release of information from the CCD could assist individuals seeking to evade the procedures used for adjudicating visas and would expose what specific information is omitted from or included in the CCD. Disclosure of these documents could therefore reasonably be expected to risk circumvention of the law, which presents a foreseeable harm.						
The Department conducted a line-by-line review of the documents and determined that there is no meaningful, non-exempt information that could be reasonably segregated and released.						
(7-10)						
A-00000764857	NIV Case Accountability Report – Audit History	1	03/08/2017	Bureau of Consular Affairs	DIF	(b)(3) INA, (b)(6), (b)(7)(C), and (b)(7)(E)
A-00000764856		1	03/30/2016			
A-00000764858		1	09/26/2019			
A-00000764859		1	03/06/2018			
DESCRIPTION: These documents are printouts from the CCD entitled "NIV Case Accountability Report – Audit History." The documents provide a record of changes made to the electronic database while processing visa applications for Mr. Cury David. The documents are marked "Sensitive But Unclassified."						
These documents pertain directly to the issuance or refusal of a visa to enter the United States. Accordingly, the Department withheld the documents in full under FOIA Exemption 3, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3), pursuant to § 222(f) of the INA, 8 U.S.C. § 1202(f).						
The Department also withheld the documents pursuant to FOIA Exemption 7(E), 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(E), as they contain information about specific law enforcement techniques used by the Department to assess an alien's eligibility for a visa. The CCD is a non-public database used to administer and enforce U.S. immigration laws and to identify and prevent instances of fraud. Release of information from the CCD could						

<u>Doc. No.</u>	<u>Doc. Type</u>	<u>Pages</u>	<u>Date / Date Range</u>	<u>Author(s) / Recipient(s)</u>	<u>Review Result</u>	<u>FOIA Exemptions Claimed</u>
assist individuals seeking to evade the procedures used for adjudicating visas and would expose what specific information is omitted from or included in the CCD. Disclosure of the documents could reasonably be expected to risk circumvention of the law, which presents a foreseeable harm.						
The Department conducted a line-by-line review of the documents and determined that there is no meaningful, non-exempt information that could be reasonably segregated and released.						
(11-17)						
A-00000764849	Independent Namecheck Detail	1	Undated	Bureau of Consular Affairs	DIF	(b)(3) INA, (b)(6), and (b)(7)(E)
A-00000764860	NIV Case Accountability Report – Namecheck Detail	2	Undated			
A-00000764861		2	Undated			
A-00000764862		2	Undated			
A-00000764863		1	Undated			
A-00000764864		2	Undated			
A-00000764865		1	Undated			
DESCRIPTION: These documents are printouts from the CCD entitled “NIV Case Accountability Report – Namecheck Detail.” The documents provide the details of the results of namechecks conducted while adjudicating visa applications for Mr. Cury David. The documents are marked “Sensitive But Unclassified.”						
The documents pertain directly to the issuance or refusal of a visa to enter the United States. Accordingly, the Department withheld the documents in full under FOIA Exemption 3, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3), pursuant to § 222(f) of the INA, 8 U.S.C. § 1202(f).						
The Department also withheld the documents pursuant to FOIA Exemption 7(E), 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(E), because they contain information about specific law enforcement techniques used by the Department to assess an alien’s eligibility for a visa. The CCD is a non-public database used to administer and enforce U.S. immigration laws and to identify and prevent instances of fraud. Release of information from the CCD could assist individuals seeking to evade the procedures used for adjudicating visas and would expose what specific information is						

<u>Doc. No.</u>	<u>Doc. Type</u>	<u>Pages</u>	<u>Date / Date Range</u>	<u>Author(s) / Recipient(s)</u>	<u>Review Result</u>	<u>FOIA Exemptions Claimed</u>
omitted from or included in the CCD. Disclosure of the documents could reasonably be expected to risk circumvention of the law, which presents a foreseeable harm.						
The Department conducted a line-by-line review of the documents and determined that there is no meaningful, non-exempt information that could be reasonably segregated and released.						
(18-27)						
A-00000764837	IAFIS Request History	1	Undated	Bureau of Consular Affairs	DIF	(b)(3) INA, (b)(6), (b)(7)(C), and (b)(7)(E)
A-00000764838	IAFIS Request History	1	Undated			
A-00000764839	IAFIS Request History	1	Undated			
A-00000764840	IAFIS Request History	1	Undated			
A-00000764841	IAFIS Request History	1	Undated			
A-00000764886	Hit Text for Visa Control	2	Undated			
A-00000764887	Hit Text for Visa Control	2	Undated			
A-00000764885	Hit Text for Visa Control	2	Undated			
A-00000764888	Hit Text for Visa Control	2	Undated			
A-00000764889	Hit Text for Visa Control	2	Undated			
DESCRIPTION: These documents are printouts from the CCD that provide the results of a fingerprint screening of a visa applicant conducted through a law enforcement database while processing visa applications for Mr. Cury David. These documents are marked "Sensitive But Unclassified."						
The Department withheld these documents in full under FOIA Exemption 3, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3), pursuant to § 222(f) of the INA, 8 U.S.C. § 1202(f), because they pertain directly to the issuance or refusal of visas to enter the United States.						
The Department also withheld the documents pursuant to FOIA Exemption 7(E), 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(E), as they contain information about specific law enforcement techniques used by the Department to assess an alien's eligibility for a visa. The CCD is a non-public database used to administer and enforce U.S. immigration laws and to identify and prevent instances of fraud. Release of information from the CCD could assist individuals seeking to evade the procedures used for adjudicating visas and would expose what specific information is omitted from or						

<u>Doc. No.</u>	<u>Doc. Type</u>	<u>Pages</u>	<u>Date / Date Range</u>	<u>Author(s) / Recipient(s)</u>	<u>Review Result</u>	<u>FOIA Exemptions Claimed</u>
included in the CCD. Disclosure of the documents could reasonably be expected to risk circumvention of the law, which presents a foreseeable harm.						
The Department conducted a line-by-line review of the documents and determined that there is no meaningful, non-exempt information that could be reasonably segregated and released.						
(28-38)						
A-00000764882	ADIS Result	19	Undated	Bureau of Consular Affairs	DIF	(b)(3) INA, (b)(6), and (b)(7)(E)
A-00000764883	ADIS Result	20	Undated			
A-00000764884	ADIS Result	20	Undated			
A-00000824103	ADIS Result	21	Undated			
A-00000824102	ADIS Result	20	Undated			
A-00000764842	IDENT Request History	39	Undated			
A-00000764843	IDENT Request History	26	Undated			
A-00000764844	IDENT Request History	26	Undated			
A-00000764845	IDENT Request History	52	Undated			
A-00000764846	IDENT Request History	26	Undated			
A-00000764847	IDENT Request History	51	Undated			
DESCRIPTION: These documents are printouts from the CCD entitled "ADIS Result" and "IDENT Request History" that contain biographic information, biometric indicators, and encounter data concerning Mr. Cury David that were consolidated from various interagency systems. These documents are marked "Sensitive But Unclassified."						
These documents pertain directly to the issuance or refusal of a visa to enter the United States. Accordingly, the Department withheld these documents in full under FOIA Exemption 3, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3), pursuant to § 222(f) of the INA, 8 U.S.C. § 1202(f).						
The Department also withheld the documents pursuant to FOIA Exemption 7(E), 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(E), as they contain information about specific law enforcement techniques used by the Department to assess an alien's eligibility for a visa. The CCD is a non-public database used to administer and enforce U.S. immigration laws and to identify and prevent instances of fraud. Release of information from the CCD could						

<u>Doc. No.</u>	<u>Doc. Type</u>	<u>Pages</u>	<u>Date / Date Range</u>	<u>Author(s) / Recipient(s)</u>	<u>Review Result</u>	<u>FOIA Exemptions Claimed</u>
assist individuals seeking to evade the procedures used for adjudicating visas and would expose what specific information is omitted from or included in the CCD. Disclosure of the documents could reasonably be expected to risk circumvention of the law, which presents a foreseeable harm.						
The Department conducted a line-by-line review of the documents and determined that there is no meaningful, non-exempt information that could be reasonably segregated and released.						
(39-54)						
A-00000764866	Law Enforcement Database System Report	1	Undated	Bureau of Consular Affairs	DIF	(b)(3) INA, (b)(5) - DPP, (b)(6), (b)(7)(C), and (b)(7)(E)
A-00000764868		1	Undated			
A-00000764870		1	Undated			
A-00000764871		1	Undated			
A-00000764872		1	Undated			
A-00000764873		1	Undated			
A-00000764874		3	Undated			
A-00000764875		2	Undated			
A-00000764867		1	Undated			
A-00000764869		1	Undated			
A-00000764876		1	Undated			
A-00000764878		1	Undated			
A-00000764877		2	Undated			
A-00000824106		3	Undated			
A-00000824105		3	Undated			
A-00000824104		3	Undated			
DESCRIPTION: These documents are printouts from the CCD that contain biographic information, biometric indicators, information system records, and encounter data consolidated from various interagency systems for Mr. Cury David. These documents are marked "Sensitive But Unclassified."						

<u>Doc. No.</u>	<u>Doc. Type</u>	<u>Pages</u>	<u>Date / Date Range</u>	<u>Author(s) / Recipient(s)</u>	<u>Review Result</u>	<u>FOIA Exemptions Claimed</u>
These documents pertain directly to the issuance or refusal of a visa to enter the United States. The Department withheld these documents in full under FOIA Exemption 3, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3), pursuant to § 222(f) of the INA, 8 U.S.C. § 1202(f).						
<p>The Department additionally withheld information in these documents describing advice provided by other government agencies as well as internal deliberations regarding proposed courses of action with respect to the applicant under FOIA Exemption 5, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5), pursuant to the deliberative process privilege.³ This information is subject to the deliberative process privilege because it is both predecisional (it predates the final visa adjudication) and deliberative (it makes a recommendation and provides advice about the final visa adjudication). The Department has considered the foreseeable harm standard when reviewing these documents and applying this FOIA exemption. In particular, release of this information would result in foreseeable harm by inhibiting candid internal discussions and the expression of recommendations and judgments regarding visa applications and preferred courses of action by Department and other U.S. Government personnel regarding the adjudication of such applications.</p> <p>The Department also withheld the documents pursuant to FOIA Exemption 7(E), 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(E), as they contain information about specific law enforcement techniques used by the Department to assess an alien's eligibility for a visa. The CCD is a non-public database used to administer and enforce U.S. immigration laws and to identify and prevent instances of fraud. Release of information from the CCD could assist individuals seeking to evade the procedures used for adjudicating visas and would expose what specific information is omitted from or included in the CCD. Disclosure of the documents could reasonably be expected to risk circumvention of the law, which presents a foreseeable harm.</p> <p>The Department conducted a line-by-line review of the documents and determined that there is no meaningful, non-exempt information that could be reasonably segregated and released.</p>						
<hr/> <p>³ The Department did not originally assert Exemption 5 in connection with these documents. Upon further review, the Department asserts this exemption over the portions of these records as described.</p>						

<u>Doc. No.</u>	<u>Doc. Type</u>	<u>Pages</u>	<u>Date / Date Range</u>	<u>Author(s) / Recipient(s)</u>	<u>Review Result</u>	<u>FOIA Exemptions Claimed</u>
(55)						
A-00000764880	FR Match Lookup Report	1	Undated	Bureau of Consular Affairs	DIF	(b)(3) INA, (b)(6), and (b)(7)(E)
DESCRIPTION: This document is a printout from the CCD entitled "Possible Matching Images" that provides the results of identity checks from a law enforcement database conducted while processing visa applications for Mr. Cury David.						
This document pertains directly to the issuance or refusal of a visa to enter the United States. The Department withheld this document in full under FOIA Exemption 3, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3), pursuant to § 222(f) of the INA, 8 U.S.C. § 1202(f).						
The Department additionally withheld the document pursuant to FOIA Exemption 7(E), 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(E), as it contains information about a specific law enforcement technique used by the Department to assess an alien's eligibility for a visa. The CCD is a non-public database used to administer and enforce U.S. immigration laws and to identify and prevent instances of fraud. Release of information from the CCD could assist individuals seeking to evade the procedures used for adjudicating visas and would expose what specific information is omitted from or included in the CCD. Disclosure of the document could reasonably be expected to risk circumvention of the law, which presents a foreseeable harm.						
The Department conducted a line-by-line review of the document and determined that there is no meaningful, non-exempt information that could be reasonably segregated and released.						
(56-57)						
A-00000764881	Visa Revocation Service	2	Undated	Bureau of Consular Affairs	DIF	(b)(3) INA, (b)(6), and (b)(7)(E)
A-00000764879		2				
DESCRIPTION: These documents are printouts from the CCD concerning the revocation of a visa pertaining to Mr. Cury David. The documents contain details about visas that the Department issued Mr. Cury David, including the expiration date and identification number of each one.						

<u>Doc. No.</u>	<u>Doc. Type</u>	<u>Pages</u>	<u>Date / Date Range</u>	<u>Author(s) / Recipient(s)</u>	<u>Review Result</u>	<u>FOIA Exemptions Claimed</u>	
These documents pertain directly to the issuance or refusal of a visa to enter the United States. The Department withheld these documents in full under FOIA Exemption 3, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3), pursuant to § 222(f) of the INA, 8 U.S.C. § 1202(f).							
The Department also withheld the documents pursuant to FOIA Exemption 7(E), 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(E), as they contain information about specific law enforcement techniques used by the Department to assess an alien's eligibility for a visa. The CCD is a non-public database used to administer and enforce U.S. immigration laws and to identify and prevent instances of fraud. Release of information from the CCD could assist individuals seeking to evade the procedures used for adjudicating visas and would expose what specific information is omitted from or included in the CCD. Disclosure of the documents could reasonably be expected to risk circumvention of the law, which presents a foreseeable harm.							
The Department conducted a line-by-line review of the documents and determined that there is no additional meaningful, non-exempt information that could be reasonably segregated and released.							
(58)	A-00000764848	Independent Lookout Accountability	1	Undated	Bureau of Consular Affairs	DIF	(b)(3) INA, (b)(6), and (b)(7)(E)
<p>DESCRIPTION: This document is a printout from the CCD entitled "Independent Lookout Accountability." The document is marked "Sensitive But Unclassified." The document provides the status of background checks conducted in the course of processing visa applications for Mr. Cury David.</p> <p>This document pertains directly to the issuance or refusal of a visa to enter the United States. The Department withheld this document in full under FOIA Exemption 3, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3), pursuant to § 222(f) of the INA, 8 U.S.C. § 1202(f).</p> <p>The Department also withheld the document pursuant to FOIA Exemption 7(E), 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(E), as it contains information about a specific law enforcement technique used by the Department to assess an alien's eligibility for a visa. The CCD is a non-public database used to administer and enforce U.S. immigration laws and identify and prevent instances of fraud. Release of information from the CCD could assist individuals seeking to evade the procedures used for adjudicating visas and would expose what specific information is omitted from or</p>							

<u>Doc. No.</u>	<u>Doc. Type</u>	<u>Pages</u>	<u>Date / Date Range</u>	<u>Author(s) / Recipient(s)</u>	<u>Review Result</u>	<u>FOIA Exemptions Claimed</u>
included in the CCD. Disclosure of the document could reasonably be expected to risk circumvention of the law, which presents a foreseeable harm.						
The Department conducted a line-by-line review of the document and determined that there is no additional meaningful, non-exempt information that could be reasonably segregated and released.						
(59-83)						
A-00000590189	Documents submitted to the Bureau of Consular Affairs on behalf of Mr. Cury David	11	Undated	Bureau of Consular Affairs, Submitted on behalf of Mr. Cury David	Release in Part ("RIP")	(b)(3) INA
A-00000590185		24	Undated			
A-00000590191		10	Undated			
A-00000590192		3	Undated			
A-00000590193		3	Undated			
A-00000590194		2	Undated			
A-00000590195		10	Undated			
A-00000590196		7	Undated			
A-00000590197		2	Undated			
A-00000590198		4	Undated			
A-00000590199		6	Undated			
A-00000590200		2	Undated			
A-00000590201		5	Undated			
A-00000590202		5	Undated			
A-00000590203		8	Undated			
A-00000590204		14	Undated			
A-00000590205		8	Undated			
A-00000590206		8	Undated			
A-00000590207		2	Undated			
A-00000590208		3	Undated			
A-00000590209		2	Undated			
A-00000590210		16	Undated			

<u>Doc. No.</u>	<u>Doc. Type</u>	<u>Pages</u>	<u>Date / Date Range</u>	<u>Author(s) / Recipient(s)</u>	<u>Review Result</u>	<u>FOIA Exemptions Claimed</u>
A-00000590211		20	Undated			
A-00000590212		9	Undated			
A-00000590213		1	Undated			

DESCRIPTION: These documents were submitted to the Bureau of Consular Affairs in connection with the NIV application for Mr. Cury David that was subsequently revoked. The documents contain information that was required for the processing of the NIV application for Mr. Cury David that was subsequently revoked.

The Department withheld certain information regarding Mr. Cury David's visa application that was not provided by the applicant and that pertains directly to the issuance or refusal of a visa to enter the United States. The Department withheld these portions under FOIA Exemption 3, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3), pursuant to § 222(f) of the INA, 8 U.S.C. § 1202(f).

The Department conducted a line-by-line review of the documents and determined that there is no additional meaningful, non-exempt information that could be reasonably segregated and released.

(84-88)

A-00000590186	Form DS-160, Non-Immigrant Visa Application	6	09/28/2011	Julio Cury	RIP	(b)(3) INA, (b)(6), and (b)(7)(C)
A-00000590187		5	03/06/2016			
A-00000590188		6	02/24/2017			
A-00000590190		6	12/19/2017			
A-00000590214		6	08/04/2019			

DESCRIPTION: These documents are printouts from the CCD of online Non-Immigrant Visa Application Form, DS-160, submissions for NIVs for Mr. Cury David. These documents are marked "Sensitive But Unclassified."

The Department withheld certain information regarding Mr. Cury David's visa applications that was not provided by the applicant. The withheld information pertains directly to the issuance or refusal of a visa to enter the United States. The Department withheld these portions under FOIA Exemption 3, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3), pursuant to § 222(f) of the INA, 8 U.S.C. § 1202(f).

<u>Doc. No.</u>	<u>Doc. Type</u>	<u>Pages</u>	<u>Date / Date Range</u>	<u>Author(s) / Recipient(s)</u>	<u>Review Result</u>	<u>FOIA Exemptions Claimed</u>
The Department conducted a line-by-line review of the documents and determined that there is no additional meaningful, non-exempt information that can be reasonably segregated and released.						
(89)						
A-00000788192	Documents submitted to the Bureau of Consular Affairs on behalf of Mr. Cury David	60	Undated	Julio Cury	RIP	(b)(3) INA, (b)(5) - DPP, (b)(6), and (b)(7)(E)
<p>DESCRIPTION: This document consists of a printout from the CCD entitled “NIV Individual Namecheck Hit Report,” notes prepared by a Bureau of Consular Affairs employee, and documents submitted to the Bureau of Consular Affairs in connection with the NIV application for Mr. Cury David that was subsequently revoked. The printout provides the details of the results of namechecks conducted while adjudicating visa applications for Mr. Cury David. These documents are marked “Sensitive But Unclassified.”</p> <p>The Department withheld certain information regarding Mr. Cury David’s visa applications that was not provided by the applicant. The withheld information pertains directly to the issuance or refusal of a visa to enter the United States. The Department withheld these portions under FOIA Exemption 3, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3), pursuant to § 222(f) of the INA, 8 U.S.C. § 1202(f).</p> <p>The Department also withheld information in this document describing internal deliberations regarding proposed courses of action with respect to the applicant under FOIA Exemption 5, 5 U.S.C. § 522(b)(5), pursuant to the deliberative process privilege.⁴ This information is subject to the deliberative process privilege because it is both predecisional (it predates the final visa adjudication) and deliberative (it makes a recommendation and provides advice about the final visa adjudication). The Department has considered the foreseeable harm standard when reviewing this document and applying this FOIA exemption. In particular, release of this information would result in foreseeable harm by inhibiting candid internal discussions and the expression of recommendations and judgments regarding visa applications and preferred courses of action by Department and other U.S. Government personnel concerning the adjudication of such applications.</p>						

⁴ The Department did not originally assert Exemption 5 in connection with these documents. Upon further review, the Department asserts this exemption over the portions of these records as described.

<u>Doc. No.</u>	<u>Doc. Type</u>	<u>Pages</u>	<u>Date / Date Range</u>	<u>Author(s) / Recipient(s)</u>	<u>Review Result</u>	<u>FOIA Exemptions Claimed</u>
The Department conducted a line-by-line review of the document and determined that there is no additional meaningful, non-exempt information that can be reasonably segregated and released.						